



**SUPPORT TO THE OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER  
FOR INFORMATION OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE AND  
PERSONAL DATA PROTECTION**

**REPORT**

**September 2010**

## **LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS**

COE – Council of Europe

IC – Office of the Information Commissioner (U.K.)

IDPC – Office of the Information and Data Protection Commissioner (Serbia)

DPC – Data Protection Commissioner (Ireland)

DPI – Data Protection Inspectorate (Lithuania)

ECHR – European Court of Human Rights

ECJ – European Court of Justice

EU – European Union

NSB – National Supervising Body (Slovenia)

PDP – personal data protection

## TABLE OF CONTENT

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>I. INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>II. METHODOLOGY.....</b>	<b>12</b>
A. PROJECT OBJECTIVES AND REQUIRED EXPERTISE.....	12
B. ACTIVITIES .....	12
C. TIMING .....	13
D. INTERVIEWS .....	13
E. ANALYSES .....	15
<b>III. RELEVANT STANDARDS AND PRINCIPLES .....</b>	<b>17</b>
A. EU LAW ON PERSONAL DATA PROTECTION .....	17
1) <i>Directive 95/46/EC</i> .....	17
2) <i>Schengen Convention</i> .....	19
3) <i>Other Relevant EU Rules</i> .....	20
4) <i>Relevant ECJ Jurisprudence</i> .....	22
a. SCOPE OF APPLICATION .....	22
b. ROLE AND INDEPENDENCE OF SUPERVISING BODY.....	23
c. PRINCIPLES AND GROUNDS OF DATA PROCESSING.....	23
d. MEDIA AND FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION.....	24
5) <i>Criticism of Directive 95/46/EC</i> .....	25
B. EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS AND OTHER GENERAL STANDARDS .....	26
1) <i>European Convention on Human Rights</i> .....	26
a. SCOPE OF APPLICATION .....	26
b. PRINCIPLES AND GROUNDS OF DATA PROCESSING.....	27
I. <i>INTELLIGENCE GATHERING AND POLICE SURVEILLANCE</i> .....	27
II. <i>MEDICAL RECORDS</i> .....	27
III. <i>ACCESS TO PERSONAL DATA AND OTHER POSITIVE OBLIGATIONS</i> .....	28
c. MEDIA AND FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION.....	28
2) <i>The Convention on Automatic Processing of Personal Data</i> .....	29
a. SCOPE OF APPLICATION .....	29
b. COMPLAINT PROCEDURES AND INVESTIGATION OF BREACHES.....	30
c. PRINCIPLES AND GROUNDS OF DATA PROCESSING.....	30
d. TRANS-BORDER MOVEMENT OF DATA.....	30
3) <i>Madrid Resolution of 2009</i> .....	31
C. COMPARATIVE LAW AND PRACTICE OF EU AND OTHER STATES .....	32
1) <i>General Remarks</i> .....	32
2) <i>Scope of Protection and Core Definitions</i> .....	33
a. MEANING OF 'PERSONAL DATA' .....	33
b. 'DATA SUBJECT', 'CONTROLLER' AND 'PROCESSOR' .....	34
c. MEANING OF 'SENSITIVE DATA' .....	35
d. SCOPE OF APPLICATION .....	35
e. EXEMPTIONS .....	36
3) <i>Role, Independence, Duties and Powers of Supervising Body</i> .....	36
a. SINGLE OR DUAL ROLE .....	36
b. INDEPENDENCE .....	37
c. DUTIES .....	37
d. POWERS .....	38
4) <i>Conditions of Processing by Data Controllers</i> .....	40
a. PRINCIPLES OF DATA PROCESSING .....	40

b.	GROUNDS FOR DATA PROCESSING .....	42
c.	OTHER CONDITIONS AND TIME-LIMITS .....	43
d.	ROLE OF DATA PROCESSOR AND DATA SECURITY .....	44
e.	OBLIGATION OF NOTIFICATION BY DATA CONTROLLER .....	45
5)	<i>Access Requests, Complaint Procedures and Investigation of Breaches.....</i>	46
a.	DATA SUBJECT ACCESS REQUEST .....	46
b.	COMPLIANCE ASSESSMENT, INVESTIGATION AND ENFORCEMENT .....	47
c.	RIGHT TO COMPENSATION .....	48
d.	ADMINISTRATIVE RESPONSIBILITY.....	49
e.	CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY.....	49
6)	<i>Trans-Border Movement of Data.....</i>	50
7)	<i>Specific Regulation in regard to Certain Sectors, Types of Data or Purposes of Processing .....</i>	53
a.	GENERAL REMARKS .....	53
b.	SENSITIVE DATA .....	53
c.	NATIONAL SECURITY, DEFENCE AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE.....	55
d.	HISTORICAL, STATISTICAL AND RESEARCH PURPOSES.....	56
e.	MEDICAL DATA.....	57
f.	MEDIA .....	58
g.	TELECOMMUNICATIONS AND INTERNET .....	58
h.	BIOMETRICS .....	58
i.	VIDEO SURVEILLANCE (CCTV).....	59
j.	BANKING, FINANCIAL AND SOLVABILITY DATA.....	60
k.	TAX AND SOCIAL SECURITY DATA .....	60
l.	EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS AND HUMAN RESOURCES.....	61
m.	EDUCATION AND SCHOOL RECORDS .....	61
n.	ELECTIONS.....	61
o.	DIRECT MARKETING .....	62
p.	PERSONAL IDENTIFICATION NUMBERS, E-DOCUMENTS & E-SIGNATURES .....	62
q.	OTHER AREAS.....	63
IV.	<b>APPLICATION OF THE RELEVANT STANDARDS IN SERBIAN LAW AND PRACTICE .....</b>	64
1)	<i>General Remarks.....</i>	64
2)	<i>Scope of Protection .....</i>	65
a.	SCOPE OF APPLICATION .....	65
b.	CORE DEFINITIONS.....	65
c.	MEANING OF 'SENSITIVE DATA' .....	66
d.	EXEMPTIONS .....	67
e.	TERRITORIAL APPLICATION OF THE LAW .....	68
3)	<i>Role, Independence, Duties and Powers of Supervising Body.....</i>	68
a.	DUAL ROLE .....	68
b.	INDEPENDENCE .....	69
c.	DUTIES .....	69
d.	POWERS .....	70
4)	<i>Conditions of Processing by Data Controllers .....</i>	71
a.	PRINCIPLES OF DATA PROCESSING .....	71
b.	GROUNDS FOR DATA PROCESSING .....	72
c.	OTHER CONDITIONS AND TIME-LIMITS .....	74
d.	ROLES OF DATA PROCESSOR AND SECURITY OF DATA .....	75
e.	OBLIGATION OF NOTIFICATION BY DATA CONTROLLER .....	76
5)	<i>Access Requests, Complaint Procedures and Investigation of Breaches.....</i>	78
a.	DATA SUBJECT ACCESS REQUEST .....	78
b.	COMPLIANCE ASSESSMENT, INVESTIGATION AND ENFORCEMENT .....	79
c.	RIGHT TO COMPENSATION .....	81
d.	RESPONSIBILITY FOR A BREACH .....	81

6) <i>Trans-Border Movement of Data</i> .....	81
7) <i>Specific Regulation in regard to Certain Types of Data or Purposes of Processing</i> .....	83
a. GENERAL REMARKS .....	83
a. SENSITIVE DATA .....	84
b. NATIONAL SECURITY, DEFENCE AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE .....	85
c. HISTORY, STATISTICS AND RESEARCH .....	85
d. MEDICAL DATA .....	86
e. MEDIA, ARTISTIC AND LITERARY EXPRESSION .....	86
f. TELECOMMUNICATIONS AND INTERNET .....	86
g. BIOMETRICS .....	87
h. VIDEO SURVEILLANCE (CCTV) .....	87
i. BANKING, FINANCIAL AND SOLVABILITY DATA .....	88
j. TAX AND SOCIAL SECURITY DATA .....	88
k. EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS AND HUMAN RESOURCES .....	88
l. EDUCATION AND SCHOOL RECORDS .....	89
m. ELECTIONS .....	89
n. DIRECT MARKETING .....	89
o. IDENTIFICATION NUMBERS, E-DOCUMENTS & E-SIGNATURES .....	90
p. OTHER AREAS .....	90
<b>V. CONCLUSIONS.....</b>	<b>92</b>
<b>VI. RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>95</b>
A. DRAFT AMENDMENTS TO THE PERSONAL DATA PROTECTION ACT .....	95
1) <i>Amendments to the existing provisions</i> .....	95
a. SCOPE OF THE LAW (Article 1.1) .....	95
b. PURPOSES OF THE ACT (Article 2) .....	95
c. DEFINITION OF TERMS (Article 3) .....	96
I. AUTHORITY .....	96
II. CONSENT .....	96
III. RECIPIENT & THIRD PARTY .....	96
d. APPLICATION OF THE LAW (Article 4) .....	97
e. EXEMPTIONS (Article 5) .....	97
I. CONTRARY INTEREST .....	97
II. MEDIA AND ART .....	97
f. PROCESSING DATA FOR HISTORICAL, STATISTICAL, RESEARCH OR DEVELOPMENT PURPOSES (Article 6) .....	98
g. CONTROLLER APPOINTED UNDER SPECIAL REGULATION (Article 7) .....	98
h. INADMISSIBILITY OF PROCESSING (Article 8) .....	99
i. PROCESSING WITH CONSENT (Article 10) .....	100
I. FORM OF CONSENT .....	100
II. WHO CONSENTS FOR A DECEASED PERSON .....	100
j. WITHDRAWAL OF CONSENT (Article 11) .....	100
k. PROCESSING WITHOUT CONSENT (Article 12) .....	101
I. CONSTITUTIONALITY .....	101
II. DATA PROCESSING IN THE FIELD OF EMPLOYMENT LAW .....	101
l. PROCESSING BY PUBLIC AUTHORITIES (Article 13) .....	101
m. DATA COLLECTION (Article 14) .....	102
n. NOTIFICATION OF DATA PROCESSING (Article 15.1) .....	102
o. PARTICULARLY SENSITIVE DATA (Article 16) .....	103
I. PROPER TRANSPOSITION OF TERMS .....	103
II. IMPLEMENTING REGULATION .....	103
p. WITHDRAWAL OF CONSENT TO PROCESSING OF PARTICULARLY SENSITIVE DATA (Article 18) .....	103
q. RIGHT TO NOTIFICATION OF DATA PROCESSING (Article 19) .....	104
r. DECIDING ON REQUESTS FOR NOTIFICATION, ACCESS AND COPY (Article 25.5) .....	104
s. DECIDING ON REQUESTS UPON OBTAINING ACCESS TO DATA (Article 26.5) .....	105

I.	PRIVILEGED POSITION OF STATE AUTHORITIES.....	105
II.	WHAT GOVERNMENT BODY.....	105
t.	PROCESSING FOR THE PURPOSES OF PUBLIC MEDIA (Article 29), ATTACHMENT OF REPLIES AND OTHER INFORMATION (Article 30), and PROTECTION OF PERSONALITY (Article 31).....	105
u.	FORWARDING OF REQUESTS TO THE COMMISSIONER (Article 32).....	106
v.	RETENTION AND USE IN THE EVENT OF DEATH (Article 35.1) .....	106
w.	ESTABLISHMENT OF FACTS IN APPEAL PROCEEDINGS (Article 40.2) .....	107
x.	MANDATORY NATURE AND ENFORCEMENT OF RULINGS (Article 41.2) .....	107
y.	LEGAL REMEDIES AGAINST RULINGS (Article 42).....	107
z.	COMMISSIONER'S DUTIES AND POWERS (Article 44).....	108
I.	GENERAL DUTIES.....	108
II.	LAW-MAKING PROCES.....	108
III.	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER.....	109
aa.	SEARCH AND ENTRY (Article 45.2-4) .....	109
bb.	CONFIDENTIALITY DUTY (Article 46.3) .....	109
cc.	ORGANISATIONAL AND TECHNICAL MEASURES (Article 47).....	110
dd.	DATA PROCESSING RECORDS (Article 48) .....	110
I.	GENERAL REMARKS.....	110
II.	CONTENT OF THE DATA FILE AND WHEN A DATA FILE IS NOT NECESSARY .....	111
III.	IMPLEMENTING REGULATION .....	111
ee.	NOTIFICATION OF THE COMMISSIONER (Article 49).....	112
I.	DEADLINE .....	112
II.	HARMONIZATION WITH THE DIRECTIVE .....	112
ff.	CENTRAL REGISTER (Article 52).....	112
I.	CONFUSING TERMS .....	112
II.	PUBLICATION IN THE OFFICIAL GAZETTE .....	112
gg.	TRANSBORDER TRANSFER OF DATA OUT OF THE REPUBLIC OF SERBIA (Article 53) .....	113
hh.	COMMISSIONER'S POWERS (Articles 56.5) .....	116
ii.	PENALTIES (Article 57) .....	116
2)	<i>Unregulated areas (new provisions of the Serbian PDP Act)</i> .....	116
a.	RECORDS OF CRIMINAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE OFFENCES AND CIVIL COURT JUDGMENTS.....	117
b.	PERSONAL IDENTIFICATION NUMBER.....	117
c.	RIGHT TO COMPENSATION .....	118
d.	MEDICAL DATA.....	118
e.	MEDIA .....	119
f.	BIOMETRICS.....	119
g.	VIDEO SURVEILLANCE .....	120
h.	ENTRY TO AND EXIT FROM PREMISES.....	120
i.	TELECOMMUNICATION AND INTERNET.....	120
j.	BANKING, FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT AND E-COMMERCE.....	121
k.	ELECTIONS.....	121
l.	PUBLIC BOOKS .....	121
m.	DIRECT MARKETING .....	122
n.	SCHOOL RECORDS.....	122
o.	EMPLOYMENT RECORDS AND HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGEMENT .....	122
p.	E-DOCUMENTS, E-SIGNATURES .....	123
a.	DATA PROCESSING IN THE JUDICIAL AND POLICE SECTOR .....	123
b.	SCHENGEN CONVENTION .....	123
c.	SECURITY COMPANIES AND PRIVATE DETECTIVES .....	124
B.	PROPOSED ACTIONS WITH RESPECT TO OTHER SECTORS: DIRECTIONS FOR REFORM .....	124
C.	SUGGESTIONS A STRATEGIC PAPER ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER IN THE MEDIUM TERM	124
VII.	ANNEXES .....	127
	ANNEX 1: TABLE OF CONCORDANCE DIRECTIVE 95/46/EC VS. THE SERBIAN PDP ACT .....	127

ANNEX 2: TABLE OF CONCORDANCE THE SCHENGEN CONVENTION (TITLE VI ONLY) VS. THE SERBIAN PDP ACT.....	165
ANNEX 3: LIST OF INTERVIEWS .....	170

The project aims one thing, and namely developing a strategy to ease the border control situation. The outcome of action is both public and private, but it will have to be decided.

The outcome of the Standard Project is the "Report to the Director of the General Directorate of Protection of Public Liberties and Personal Data Protection on the status of the implementation of the Schengen Acquis in Serbia" which provides an assessment of the current status of the law with regard to the protection of personal data and privacy.

In order to achieve the Project objectives, the Report contains a detailed analysis of existing legislation regarding data protection and how it compares to the relevant provisions of the Directive. It highlights existing standards such as the so-called "soft law" (Guidelines of the European Commission) and the principles of the Directive. It also highlights specific ways that personal data protection rules should be reflected in the Serbian PDP Act or other domestic standards and model laws from a European perspective. In addition to the law, the Report also covers the practical application of the protection of personal data in different fields such as the medical and financial sectors, among others, in which the right connects with other rights (e.g. the freedom of expression, the right to privacy, etc.).

The Report consists of the following parts: methodology, results, findings and practical application of the relevant standards in Serbian law and practice, and the conclusions and recommendations.

The Directive is a tool with a regulatory framework balancing the protection of the right of individuals not to be exposed to automated decision-making by the State and its agencies. The Directive specifically sets the obligation and timeline to implement measures for Member States to prevent one or more automated decisions from being taken for the protection of personal data and the protection of the fundamental rights of individuals concerning the Directive.

The former agreement implemented by the League implemented the common agreement on the mutual obligation of checks at their common borders (the Schengen Agreement) and also adopted as one of the relevant standards, an agreed set of minimum requirements which must be met by Member States in personal data processing.

The Expert Team also reflected on aspects of the reinforcement of the European internal market in the field of data protection, as well as the conditions applying in the public and private sectors.

The final and the following chapters (and the Annexes) present the main findings of this Project as developed in the Report.

In addition, the Report highlights the main findings and conclusions of the previous findings of several other studies on the same subject matter, including those from: